

PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL
ATTORNEY'S WORK PRODUCT

November 13, 1992

MEMORANDUM

Re: Meetings in Buenos Aires Relating to the ETS Consultants Program

This memorandum summarizes the results of a series of meetings in Buenos Aires on November 9 relating to the ETS Consultants Program. The purpose of the meetings was to discuss activities that might be undertaken or sponsored by the tobacco industry during 1993.

The backdrop for our discussions in Buenos Aires was the antitobacco legislation that was vetoed recently by President Menem but is expected to be reintroduced when the Argentine Parliament reconvenes in 1993. Although the precise content of the new legislation is not yet certain, Messrs. Vives and Basso believe that it is likely to contain proposed smoking restrictions as well as limitations on tobacco advertising. Because of the immediacy of this legislative threat, we agreed that ETS consultant efforts in Argentina during 1993 need to be organized along two complementary lines -- the first of which would focus on the anticipated legislation and the second of which would seek to buttress the industry's position over the longer term.

A. Activities Focusing on Possible 1993 Smoking Restriction Legislation

The reports we have received indicate that Dr. Carlos Alvarez played a very useful role in the larger

2503011668

industry efforts to defeat, and then to convince President Menem to veto, the antitobacco legislation approved by the Argentine Parliament at the end of 1992. Dr. Alvarez's activities included conversations with Senators from both parties and a series of conversations with President Menem as well as President Menem's brother, who serves as President of the Argentine Senate. Dr. Alvarez also provided President Menem with a briefing package and covering letter that pointed out that the smoking restrictions that had been proposed lacked a solid scientific basis. According to Dr. Alvarez, Dr. Fustinoni -- while aware of the pending legislation -- did not provide any substantial assistance.

We discussed during our meetings on November 9 the following activities focusing on the likely reintroduction of smoking restriction legislation in 1993:

1. Legislative Meetings. Dr. Alvarez is prepared to host a series of dinners at his home, as well as other meetings as appropriate, with key government officials and important members of the Argentine press. The immediate occasion for such gatherings might be a series of visits to Argentina by (a) a current or former member of the United States Congress, (b) a consulting scientist from the United States and/or (c) some other individual qualified to talk about the inappropriateness of smoking restrictions in view of other problems and challenges confronting Argentine policymakers.

2503011669

Dr. Alvarez would be responsible for issuing invitations to the gatherings. He also would act as the host, providing a few words of introduction for the United States guest and, following the guest's presentation, summarizing some of the main arguments against smoking restrictions. Throughout, every effort would be made to preserve the informality of the gatherings. If the guest on a particular occasion is a current or former member of the United States Congress, smoking restrictions might be only one of several topics addressed, with the political and/or economic situation in the United States perhaps taking top billing.

The gatherings described above could be held most any time. The HBI representative in Spain may attend the consultants meeting we have scheduled for Santiago on January 28 and 29. One option would be to take advantage of that fact by organizing an Alvarez-hosted gathering either immediately before or after the Santiago meeting. We also may invite one or more international scientists to the Santiago meeting who could be prevailed upon to stay an extra day or so to assist Dr. Alvarez. If the decision is made to attempt to convince a current member of the United States Congress to travel to Argentina, the trip probably should be scheduled before Congress reconvenes in late January.

2. McGill Distribution. The Spanish-language version of the McGill monograph is expected to be available within the next eight weeks. Dr. Alvarez is prepared to

2503011670

assist with distribution of the McGill publication. He also is prepared to write and publish reviews of McGill for both scientific and lay publications. A Spanish-language version of "Other People's Tobacco Smoke" also may be available by the end of this year or early 1993. Distribution and promotion plans also need to be developed for that publication, which -- more than the McGill monograph -- may appeal to lay audiences. Dr. Fustinoni is prepared to assist with the distribution of both publications, perhaps through the Argentine National Academy of Sciences.

3. Fustinoni Review. Dr. Fustinoni presented at the ETS consultants meeting held at the beginning of 1992 a reasonably comprehensive review of the science of ETS. With a bit of editing and updating, which has been delayed because of budgetary constraints, the Fustinoni review could be submitted for publication in an Argentine scientific journal. We have recommended that an effort be made to complete the Fustinoni review in time for it to be used in connection with the industry's 1993 efforts on smoking restrictions.

4. Burger/Alvarez Cardiovascular Review. Drs. Burger and Alvarez have been collaborating over the past few months on a review article addressing the claims that have been made concerning ETS and cardiovascular disease. The article should be in final form before the end of this year. It was agreed that an effort should be made to publish the Burger/Alvarez cardiovascular article in a scientific journal

2503011671

in the United Kingdom. The article then could be distributed in Argentina on a selective, carefully targeted basis by Dr. Alvarez as well as by industry representatives. Some journalists might be encouraged to write their own articles using the Burger/Alvarez article as the stepping off point.

5. Other Reviews. Messrs. Vives and Basso emphasized during our meeting the potential value in Argentina of ETS smoking restriction articles published in the United States and Europe. We agreed in that connection to consider encouraging one of our international consultants to prepare and publish such an article, which might then be circulated in Argentina by the industry or one of our Argentine consultants. To be of maximum value, the article would need to be written in a style readily understandable by lay people -- members of the Argentine Parliament and press in particular.

6. International Press Responses. Finally, but by no means of least significance, Messrs. Vives and Basso emphasized the importance of our devising an approach for addressing the problems presented in Argentina of press and wire articles originating outside Argentina. We discussed several options in that connection, all of which require additional cooperation by headquarters staff at PMI and BAT. To focus our discussion of this topic, we considered at some length the damage being done to the industry's smoking restriction position in Argentina by publicity describing the restrictions implemented recently in France. Messrs. Vives and Basso both

2503011672

felt that they had not been able to counter that publicity effectively, in large part because they have not had access to articles describing the problems that have arisen in France because of the restrictions.

We agreed that one approach to problems like that presented by the French smoking restriction example, which has clear implications for the legislative battle being fought in Argentina, would be for Messrs. Vives and Basso to alert their headquarters offices to needs as they arise. Ideally, this should be followed by consultations between PMI and BAT at the headquarters level looking to provide a prompt response to the request. In the case of the French smoking restriction publicity, to continue that example, someone might be given the assignment of contacting the head of the French NMA for copies of any articles published in the French press describing the problems the smoking restriction measures implemented there have caused. Messrs. Vives and Basso then would take responsibility for attempting to interest Argentine journalists in covering the French smoking restriction story from the perspective provided by such articles.

In addition, we agreed that further efforts need to be made to convince the international wire services and international "feeder" press to carry stories that might be utilized in Argentina. Messrs. Vives and Basso recognize some of the problems that have been encountered by the industry in the past in that area but would urge that further efforts be made.

2503011673

Messrs. Vives and Basso recommended that this issue also be included on the agenda for the January meeting in Miami.

B. Other 1993 Activities

We also discussed at our meetings on November 9 a variety of other activities that might be undertaken during 1993. A brief description of those activities follows:

1. Tokyo ETS Symposium. We agreed that Dr. Alvarez should be invited to the ETS symposium that has been scheduled for April 2 and 3, 1993, in Tokyo, most likely serving on the panel that will have responsibility for considering the claims that have been made concerning ETS and cardiovascular disease. We agreed further that Dr. Alvarez should be accompanied to the meeting by one of three prominent Argentine journalists -- in order of initial preference by Messrs. Vives and Basso, Dr. Claudio Zinn, Dr. Nelson Castro and Horacio De Dios. The ultimate goal would be to stimulate a series of articles on ETS in the Argentine media, written by Dr. Alvarez as well as by the journalist accompanying him to the Tokyo meeting. *Muy Interesante* and *Salud* are two possible target publications.

Dr. Alvarez has agreed to attend the Tokyo symposium if invited. He also is prepared to attempt to convince one of the journalists mentioned by Messrs. Vives and Basso to accompany him to Tokyo. In that connection, Dr. Alvarez strongly recommended that Horacio De Dios -- rather than Drs. Zinn or Castro -- be asked to accompany him. A final decision on any

2503011674

Argentine invitees to the Tokyo meeting should be made within the next two weeks.

The expense that would be incurred by the industry in asking Dr. Alvarez and a companion to attend the Tokyo ETS symposium would be limited to the payment of travel expenses plus a \$1,000 U.S. honorarium -- or a total of approximately \$6,000 U.S. per participant. Any writing assignments for Dr. Alvarez flowing from the Tokyo symposium would be included as part of our central program budget, as would any subsequent efforts by Drs. Alvarez and/or Fustinoni to distribute in Argentina copies of the symposium publication.

2. ETS Symposium for South and Central America.

No final decision was made at the November 9 meetings in Buenos Aires concerning the priority that should be given to the holding in Argentina of an ETS/indoor air quality symposium during 1993. We had discussed previously the prospect of holding such a meeting near the end of 1993 in Buenos Aires, with attendees being drawn from all major South and Central American countries. Messrs. Vives and Basso expressed some reservations about such a meeting, in large part on cost grounds. Dr. Alvarez, in a subsequent meeting, argued strongly that such a meeting would be of great and continuing value.

Dr. Alvarez indicated during our meeting that he believes that he and Dr. Fustinoni would be able to convince the Argentine National Academy of Sciences and National

2503011675

Academy of Medicine to sponsor and host a major regional meeting on ETS/indoor air issues. The ideal time for such a meeting, in Dr. Alvarez's view, would be October or November 1993. He recommends that the meeting be open and that arrangements be made to accommodate up to 300 participants. A modest registration fee could be charged for the meeting but such fees are unlikely to cover the meeting's full cost. The possibility of our scheduling a regional ETS/indoor air symposium during 1993 should be discussed at the industry meeting that has been scheduled for January in Miami.

3. Recruitment of Argentine Indoor Air Quality

Specialist. Dr. Alvarez, in conjunction with Dr. Fustinoni, has agreed to begin making discreet inquiries concerning air quality specialists -- affiliated with a major Argentine university -- who might be willing to begin consulting with us.

Dr. Alvarez stated that Dr. Raoul Mattera, Secretary of the Federal Science and Technology Department, with whom Dr. Alvarez has extremely close ties, may be able to recommend some appropriate candidates. Recruitment of an air quality specialist is, of course, an essential prerequisite to our undertaking an indoor air quality study of the type described below.

4. Argentine Indoor Air Quality Study. Argentina

is one of the countries for which research funding may be available under the EEC cooperative research program. We discussed during our meetings on November 9 the possibility of

2503011676

submitting such a proposal to the EEC as soon as an appropriate Argentine institution as well as an appropriate individual researcher or research group have been identified. Dr. Alvarez indicated in that connection that the Technology Institute of Buenos Aires, which had been discussed as a possible source of air quality consultants, does not have sufficient prestige within academic or government circles to warrant recruitment of an individual from that institution. Although Chile is not one of the target countries under the EEC cooperative research program, it may be possible to include work in Chile as part of a proposal focusing on Argentina, thus providing an opportunity to include our Chilean consultants in the research effort.

John P. Rupp

2503011677